

Article history: Received 30 September 2023 Revised 08 November 2023 Accepted 17 November 2023 Published online 01 January 2024

Psychology of Woman Journal

Open peer-review report



Reclaiming the Body: Identity Reconstruction in Women Recovering from Eating Disorders

Laura. Bennett¹, Samuel. Moreau^{2*}, Brian. Matthews³

^{*} Corresponding author email address: samuel.moreau@mcgill.ca

Editor	Reviewers
Hussein OMAR Alkhozahe [®]	Reviewer 1: Mohsen Kachooei ©
Professor, Department of Sociology,	Assistant Professor of Health Psychology, Department of Psychology, Humanities
Al-Balqa' Applied University, Salt,	Faculty, University of Science and Culture, Tehran, Iran. kachooei.m@usc.ac.ir
Jordan	Reviewer 2: Nadereh Saadati®
huss1960@bau.edu.com	Department of Couple and Family therapy, Alliant International University,
	California, United States of America. mdaneshpour@alliant.edu

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The opening paragraph would benefit from greater clarity by operationalizing "identity reconstruction" early on. Consider adding a sentence that defines what "reconstructing identity" entails within the context of eating disorder recovery.

The sentence "This detachment can foster a form of dissociation..." would benefit from elaborating on the psychological mechanisms linking dissociation and identity fragmentation. Citing literature on trauma and dissociation in eating disorders would enhance depth.

Consider referencing classic theories such as Bruch's (1978) work on control and anorexia, which provides historical grounding for this idea.

While you mention the sociocultural construction of body dissatisfaction, integrating intersectional theory more directly (e.g., Crenshaw's framework) could enhance the discussion on how overlapping identities exacerbate vulnerability.

The participant quote "I stopped seeing myself as broken..." is compelling. It would be helpful to tie this to relevant narrative therapy or self-compassion literature to support interpretation.

The table is informative, but the formatting is inconsistent (e.g., the final row appears truncated: "Creating recovery r..."). Please ensure full entries are included and aligned clearly.

Department of Educational Psychology, University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada
Department of Family Counseling, McGill University, Montreal, Canada

³ Department of Health Psychology, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, USA



You mention "psychological flexibility" but do not define it. Consider briefly describing it (e.g., acceptance of inner experience, behavioral adaptability) and citing Hayes et al. to provide conceptual clarity.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

This metaphor is powerful but requires citation support from feminist or body image theory. Adding a foundational source such as Bordo (1993) or Gill (2007) could strengthen this conceptual framing.

When stating, "thinness has been idealized as a marker of self-discipline," it would be useful to mention any recent shifts in beauty ideals, such as the rise of "fitspiration," to reflect evolving cultural norms.

This is an important intersectional note. However, the study focuses solely on cisgender women. To avoid scope confusion, it may help to clarify here that transgender experiences are referenced to situate broader sociocultural implications, not to generalize findings.

The demographic data are rich, but the article would benefit from including a table summarizing participant characteristics, including age, ethnicity, diagnosis, education, and employment, to enhance clarity and reader engagement.

While the themes are well-described, the concept "medical objectification" could be unpacked further. What specific systemic practices contributed to this feeling—was it solely weight monitoring or something broader?

Consider discussing whether certain platforms (e.g., Reddit, Instagram, or specific forums) were more beneficial, and if so, what features (e.g., anonymity, visual expression) made them therapeutic.

The quote "For once, I was calling the shots..." could be contextualized with self-determination theory or autonomy-supportive therapeutic models to deepen the theoretical insight.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

