

Comparison of the Effectiveness of Reality Therapy and Emotion-Focused Therapy on Self-Esteem and Communication Beliefs in Divorced Women

Fatemeh. Souril¹, Mohammad Mehdi. Jahangiri^{2*}, Zabih. Pirani³


¹ PhD Student of General Psychology, Department of Psychology, Arak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Arak, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Arak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Arak, Iran



³ Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Arak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Arak, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: mm.jahangiri@iau.ac.ir

Editor

Donatella Di Corrado
Associate Professor, Department of
psychology, Kore University of
Enna, Enna, Italy
donatella.dicorrado@unikore.it

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Manijeh Daneshpour
Department of Couple and Family therapy, Alliant International University,
California, United States of America. mdaneshpour@alliant.edu
Reviewer 2: Ali Khodaei
Department of Psychology, Faculty of Educational Sciences and Psychology, Payam
Noor University, Tehran, Iran. Email: alikhodaei@pnu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the introduction, the sentence "Marriage still holds great importance for women and society, serving as one of the primary means of strengthening social status and obtaining social privileges..." (Arshad et al., 2024) appears to present a culturally bound assumption. It would strengthen the argument to include data or references that support this claim, preferably from multiple cultural perspectives.

The Self-Esteem Scale by Doosti and Hosseini-Nia (2020) is used, but there is no discussion of whether this scale has been validated for use with divorced women or within the Iranian cultural context. Consider adding evidence for its validity in the study population.

The study states, "After obtaining their consent to participate in the study, the scheduling of sessions was arranged, and the research questionnaires were provided for completion." It would be useful to describe whether participants completed the questionnaires in a supervised setting or remotely, as this affects response reliability.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The introduction discusses the impact of divorce on self-esteem but does not clearly explain how communication beliefs relate to self-esteem. The study would benefit from a clearer theoretical integration of self-esteem and communication beliefs within the framework of psychological well-being.

The statement, "Various studies have recognized the significant role of communication beliefs between spouses, linking dysfunctional communication beliefs with poor relationship quality, emotional disintegration, and emotional failure..." cites multiple references (Naderi et al., 2009; Shahrestani et al., 2012). However, there is little discussion of the mechanisms by which communication beliefs influence these outcomes. A deeper theoretical explanation would enhance the rigor of this section.

The study describes the intervention process well but does not specify whether therapists were trained equally in both Reality Therapy and Emotion-Focused Therapy. Did the same therapists conduct both interventions, and how was fidelity to the intervention protocol ensured?

The text states, "The results of the Shapiro-Wilk test showed that the distribution of data at the pre-test, post-test, and follow-up stages for the variables was normal." However, considering the sample size, nonparametric alternatives should be discussed in case normality assumptions were not met.

The discussion effectively summarizes findings but does not sufficiently explain why Reality Therapy and Emotion-Focused Therapy had similar outcomes. A theoretical discussion on the possible overlapping mechanisms of change in both therapies would strengthen this section.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.