

Article history: Received 28 August 2024 Revised 25 November 2024 Accepted 04 December 2024 Published online 01 January 2025

## **Psychology of Woman Journal**

Open peer-review report



# Effectiveness of Islamic Group Spiritual Therapy on Happiness and Reduction of Loneliness Among Women Visiting Counseling Centers in Bushehr

Setareh. Mohannaee 10, Farzad. Poorgholamy 20, Seyyedeh Sahar. Mousavi Shoorgoli 30, Raeis Hasan. Raeissaadi 40

Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Khormuj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Khormuj, Iran
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology and Educational Sciences, Payame Noor University, Tehran, Iran
MA in Department of Clinical Psychology, Bushehr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bushehr, Iran
PhD in Psychology, Bandar Abbas Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bandar Abbas, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: farzad.pgh@gmail.com

Editor	Reviewers
Parisa Nilforooshan <sup>®</sup>	Reviewer 1: Farhad Namjoo
Professor of Psychology Associate	Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond
Professor, Counseling Department,	Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: farhadnamjoo@kmanresce.ca
Faculty of Educational Sciences and	Reviewer 2: Manijeh Daneshpour
Psychology, Isfahan University,	Department of Couple and Family therapy, Alliant International University,
Isfahan	California, United States of America. mdaneshpour@alliant.edu
p.nilforooshan@edu.ui.ac.ir	

#### 1. Round 1

#### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The introduction discusses the advantages of Islamic spirituality, but it could benefit from a deeper exploration of how Islamic spiritual therapy specifically differs from other spiritual or religious therapy models. For example, highlighting unique practices or interventions within Islamic spirituality (e.g., prayer, Quranic recitation) would provide a clearer distinction from Western-based spiritual therapies.

The section on spiritual therapy and mental health could benefit from discussing the potential mechanisms through which Islamic spiritual therapy impacts mental health. For instance, does it provide cognitive reframing, emotional regulation, or enhance social support? A more detailed explanation of how Islamic spirituality works therapeutically would add depth to this argument.

While the inclusion and exclusion criteria are well-defined, further clarification on how the participants' "lower levels of happiness" and "higher levels of loneliness" were assessed could improve transparency. Were these self-reported measures or



assessed through standardized instruments? Additionally, could you discuss the potential impact of any demographic variables (e.g., age, marital status) on the results?

The discussion highlights how the findings align with previous research, but it would be helpful to critically examine any discrepancies between your findings and those of other studies. For example, why might your study have yielded stronger effects on happiness compared to Sadri Damirchi et al. (2018) or Soudani et al. (2012)?

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

#### 1.2. Reviewer 2

#### Reviewer:

While the review mentions significant studies on spiritual therapy, a more critical analysis of these sources would enhance the depth. For example, you cite studies like Yaghoubi & Pourbarar (2021) and Khaleghipour et al. (2019), but a comparison of their methodologies and findings could help in contextualizing your study's design and its potential contributions.

It is mentioned that participants were randomly assigned to either the experimental or control group, but it is unclear whether this randomization was done at the individual or group level. Providing more detail on this aspect would help clarify the robustness of the randomization process.

The descriptive statistics in Table 1 provide helpful information. However, it would be useful to include more statistical measures, such as effect sizes or confidence intervals, to better understand the magnitude and reliability of the differences observed between groups.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

### 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

