





## Sociological Analysis of the Sense of Social Belonging Among Women in the Urban Community of Arak

Zahra. Bayati<sup>1</sup>, Jila. Mashhadi<sup>2\*</sup>, Maryam. Yarmohammadousky<sup>2</sup>, Faranak. Seyyedi<sup>3</sup>


<sup>1</sup> PhD Student, Department of Sociology, Arak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Arak, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology, Arak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Arak, Iran



<sup>3</sup> Associate Professor, Department of Sociology, Arak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Arak, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: Jilamashhadi@yahoo.com

### Editor

Firouzeh Sepehrianazar  
Professor of Psychology  
Department, Urmia University, Iran  
f.sepehrianazar@urmia.ac.ir

### Reviewers

**Reviewer 1:** Ali Khodaei  
Department of Psychology, Faculty of Educational Sciences and Psychology, Payam  
Noor University, Tehran, Iran. Email: alikhodaei@pnu.ac.ir  
**Reviewer 2:** Nadereh Saadati  
Department of Couple and Family therapy, Alliant International University,  
California, United States of America. mdaneshpour@alliant.edu

### 1. Round 1

#### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the introduction, the study cites Durkheim and Giddens to support the significance of social belonging but does not sufficiently justify the focus on Arak specifically. Consider elaborating on why this city was chosen as a case study.

Factor analysis and structural equation modeling are mentioned. However, the report of KMO (0.665) suggests marginal adequacy. Address whether this value aligns with commonly accepted thresholds (e.g., >0.70).

The discussion uses Durkheim's concept of collective consciousness but does not connect this to the specific dimensions of belonging measured in the study. Provide a clearer linkage.

The literature review heavily relies on older studies (e.g., Giddens, 1997) and lacks integration of more recent works post-2020. Incorporate newer studies to enhance relevance.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

#### 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The operationalization of "social belonging" is broad. For example, in the paragraph discussing its dimensions ("sense of belonging to symbols, norms, and values; social trust; extreme individualism; and socioeconomic status"), the term could benefit from precise definitions supported by prior literature.

While the CVR and Cronbach's alpha values are mentioned, the statement "results indicated acceptable CVR values" does not specify the criteria for acceptability. Include thresholds or benchmarks for comparison.

The findings indicate "42% of women expressed dissatisfaction with urban symbols and norms". Discuss why this percentage is significant and how it compares to benchmarks or similar studies.

While the study focuses on urban women in Arak, cultural factors influencing social belonging are not sufficiently addressed. For example, how do local customs or traditions shape the sense of belonging?

While limitations are mentioned, the claim that "some variables were not examined in detail" is vague. Specify which variables and why they were excluded.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.