




Comparing the Effectiveness of Gymnastics Training and Teaching Games for Understaing (TGfU) for Enhancing Creativity and Motivation in Children Aged 4 to 11

Sepideh. Shakerian¹, Kiana. Hosseini Shakib¹, Meysam. Rezaee^{1*}

¹ Department of Physical Education and Sport Sciences, Mashhad Branch, Islamic Azad University, Mashhad, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: rezaee4703@mshdiau.ac.ir

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Mohsen Golparvar  Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran mgolparvar@khuif.ac.ir	Reviewer 1: Mohammad Masoud Dayarian  Assistant Professor, Department of Counseling, Khomeinishahr Branch, Islamic Azad University. Komeinishar/Isfahan, Iran. dayariyan@iaukhsh.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Ali Akbar Soleymanian  Associate Professor of Counseling Department, Bojnord University, Iran. Email: Soleymanian@ub.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "TGfU and gymnastics training both offer valuable contributions to physical education..." could be improved by briefly summarizing how these contributions are uniquely beneficial, instead of generalizing their strengths.

In the description of the Creativity Questionnaire for Children, the scoring methodology is clear, but it would be helpful to specify the validity and reliability of this instrument.

The inclusion of specific exercises is helpful, but consider discussing how these exercises were tailored to the developmental needs of the different age groups.

The phrase "constructive feedback on their progress" could be expanded with examples of the type of feedback given and its alignment with motivational theories.

The stronger impact of gymnastics on creativity could be more deeply analyzed by exploring potential interactions between physical and cognitive development.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The statement "TGfU shifts the focus from repetitive skill drills to an integrated approach..." would benefit from an example illustrating this shift, such as a specific sport or activity.

The mention of constructivist learning theory is appropriate, but a citation or brief explanation of how it directly connects to TGfU would strengthen this claim.

Consider expanding the reference to Aryanti et al. (2022) with a brief explanation of how the TGfU model specifically enhanced overhead passing skills, to better contextualize its effectiveness.

The results are clear, but the explanation in the text should discuss the implications of the standard deviations in more detail to highlight variability.

The sentence "TGfU creates autonomy-supportive environments..." would benefit from further elaboration on how autonomy-supportive practices were implemented in this study.

The statement "Gymnastics training also improved motivation..." could explore potential cultural or demographic factors influencing why gymnastics had a smaller impact on motivation.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.