

Comparison of the Effectiveness of Attachment-Based Play Therapy and Cognitive-Behavioral Therapy on Emotional Regulation and Quality of Life in Children with Separation Anxiety Disorder

Fatemeh. Shamsabadi¹, Bahram. Mirzaian^{2*}, Ghodratollah. Abbasi³

¹ PhD Student, Department of Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran


³ Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: bahrammirzaian@gmail.com

Editor

Mohsen Golparvar
Professor, Department of
Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan)
Branch, Islamic Azad University,
Isfahan, Iran
mgolparvar@khuif.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Farideh Dokanehi Fard
Associate Professor, Counseling Department, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad University, Roudehen, Iran. Email: f.dokaneifard@riau.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Stephen C. L. Lau
Professor (Assistant) at Washington University in St. Louis, United States.
Email: lauc@wustl.edu

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The introduction provides a solid background but lacks a clear gap in the literature. After “The parent-child relationship is one of the most important and foundational relationships in human life (Chirico et al., 2020),” add a sentence explaining why prior studies have not sufficiently compared these two therapy types.

The effect sizes in Table 2 are significant, but the practical implications are unclear. After “Effect size indicators suggest ABT led to greater improvements in parent-child relationships”, add a comparison to existing literature.

The statement “The Shapiro-Wilk test statistics for pre-test, post-test, and follow-up scores... were significant, indicating that the distribution of variables was normal” is misleading. If the Shapiro-Wilk test was significant, normality is violated. Clarify whether transformations or non-parametric tests were considered.

More discussion on how these findings compare to previous research is needed. After "These findings are consistent with Zamani and Babadi (2023), Bahmani (2023), and Kianoush et al. (2023)", include a brief synthesis of how this study adds novel insights.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The statement “Quality of life is influenced by factors that give life value and contribute to positive experiences (Simon-Siaz et al., 2018)” lacks specificity. Define the key aspects of quality of life relevant to this study.

The discussion on emotional regulation in "Emotional regulation is a mechanism through which individuals (consciously or unconsciously) alter their emotions..." repeats similar concepts multiple times. Consider streamlining this explanation.

The phrase “These were randomly assigned to two experimental groups of 15 participants each and one control group of 15 participants” needs further details. Specify the randomization method (e.g., stratified random sampling, simple randomization).

The criterion “no severe physical or psychological illness as determined by a psychologist and psychiatrist” is vague. Specify which disorders were screened out and how severity was assessed.

While Tables 1-4 present numerical results, visual representations (e.g., line graphs for pre-test, post-test, and follow-up comparisons) would enhance clarity.

The discussion section states “These findings indicate that attachment-based play therapy causes improvements in parent-child relationships.” Since this is a quasi-experimental study, replace "causes" with "is associated with."

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor’s decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.