

Factors Contributing to Identity Confusion in Adolescents from Immigrant Families




Laura. Bennett¹, Samuel. Moreau^{2*}, Brian. Matthews³

¹ Department of Educational Psychology, University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada

² Department of Family Counseling, McGill University, Montreal, Canada

³ Department of Health Psychology, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, USA

* Corresponding author email address: samuel.moreau@mcgill.ca

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
John S. Carlson  Distinguished Professor of the Department of Educational Psychology, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, United carlsoj@msu.edu	Reviewer 1: Fahime Bahonar  Department of counseling, Universty of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran. Email: Fahime.bahonar@edu.ui.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Mahdi Khanjani  Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Allameh Tabataba'i University, Tehran, Iran. Email: khanjani_m@atu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the Data Collection section, the sentence “The interview protocol included open-ended questions...” could be expanded by providing at least two example questions, which would enhance the transparency and replicability of the study.

The paragraph beginning “Educational settings also play a significant role...” might be strengthened by specifying whether the participants in this study provided direct narratives regarding their school environments or whether this insight was inferred from the literature.

In the paragraph beginning “Linguistic and religious affiliations also contribute...,” consider elaborating on whether specific religions or linguistic groups were overrepresented in the sample. This would help contextualize the statements regarding “dress codes, dietary practices, and worship routines.”

The concept of Bicultural Strain, introduced under Cultural Dissonance, is well described. However, the article should clarify whether the strain was more related to language, behaviors, values, or a combination—and how these sub-elements interact.

The quote “My mom still thinks I’ll be corrupted by Western TV...” could be better contextualized by connecting it with the relevant literature on media acculturation and intergenerational cultural retention.

The paragraph under Shame and Guilt includes the quote “Sometimes I hate my name or my lunch...” This powerful quote could be analytically tied to internalized racism or cultural inferiority frameworks to deepen the interpretation.

The section Exploration of Identity under Navigating Self and Future includes the quote “I’m still figuring it out...” Consider linking this more explicitly to Marcia’s stages of identity development or related psychosocial theories.

In the Discussion, the sentence “Educational and community settings also emerged as pivotal spaces...” would benefit from more direct elaboration on how many participants described these settings positively versus negatively.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the Findings and Results section, there is an inconsistency in the paragraph reporting demographics: “Demographically, the average (standard deviation) age was 21.61 (2.32) for the Cognitive Behavioral Therapy (CBT) group...” This appears to be mistakenly copied from another study and is irrelevant to the current article. It must be removed to avoid confusion.

In the introduction, the sentence “Adolescents often find themselves caught between parental expectations...” could benefit from a direct quote or illustrative example to ground the concept of value conflict in lived experience.

The sentence in the discussion—“Adolescents reported internal tension as they sought to meet parental expectations...”—might benefit from quantitative descriptors (e.g., “the majority,” “a minority”) to better communicate how widespread this experience was among participants.

The phrase in the conclusion—“identity is not a static or binary concept...”—although conceptually rich, would benefit from a brief reference to how many participants explicitly described their identity as “fluid” or “hybrid,” to tie theory more directly to empirical data.

The subcategory titled “Loss of Cultural Continuity” is conceptually important. However, the analysis could be enriched by clarifying whether this loss was experienced more acutely by adolescents from specific ethnic groups or religious backgrounds.

In the paragraph under Family Expectations and Role Strain, the sentence “I do everything—translate bank stuff...” could benefit from analytic interpretation linking this role burden to theories of parentification or emotional labor in immigrant families.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor’s decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.