

Article history: Received 13 February 2024 Revised 22 April 2024 Accepted 29 April 2024 Published online 10 May 2024

Journal of Adolescent and Youth Psychological Studies

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 2981-2526

Key Factors Contributing to Emotional Suppression in Male Adolescents

Badhon. Ahmmed 100, Ayesha. Khan 2*00

* Corresponding author email address: ayesha.khan@pu.edu.pk

E	d	1	t	O	r

Thseen Nazir®

Professor of Psychology and Counseling Department, Ibn Haldun University, Istanbul, Turkey thseen.nazir@ihu.edu.tr

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Mohammadreza Zarbakhsh Bahri

Associate Professor 'Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran. Email: M.Zarbakhsh@Toniau.ac.ir

Reviewer 2: Sara Nejatifar (1)

Department of Psychology and Education of People with Special Needs, Faculty of Educational Sciences and Psychology, University of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran.

Email: s.nejatifar@edu.ui.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "This internalization of hegemonic masculinity norms can lead to significant emotional incongruence..." (Introduction) would benefit from clarification. Define "emotional incongruence" operationally or provide an example from Pakistani culture for contextual specificity.

In the paragraph starting "Parental influence on adolescents' emotional development has been widely documented...", the discussion is Western-centric. Include Pakistani or South Asian studies to strengthen the cultural grounding of the argument.

In the Introduction's closing paragraph, the claim "limited empirical work has explored the specific mechanisms of emotional suppression in male adolescents" would benefit from referencing a specific literature gap or review to validate this assertion.

The Methods section states, "Purposive sampling method was employed...". Please specify the inclusion and exclusion criteria beyond age, gender, and geography (e.g., school enrollment, prior mental health diagnosis) for transparency and replicability.

The Findings section reports that "recruitment aimed to capture a diverse range of emotional experiences...", yet only urban and semi-urban adolescents were included. Acknowledge and discuss this geographic limitation earlier in the methodology.

¹ Department of Psychology, Haripur University, Islamabad, Pakistan

² Department of Psychology, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

In the subtheme "Emotional Literacy Deficits," the quote "Don't know what I feel" is compelling. Consider discussing whether participants had access to emotional vocabulary development in school curricula, especially in Urdu or regional languages.

The Discussion paragraph on "school-based emotional development" states "teachers and peers alike discouraged emotional expression." It would be useful to mention if any participants reported exceptions—e.g., emotionally supportive teachers.

In the Discussion section, the sentence "Internalized ideals of toughness and emotional independence were also evident..." would benefit from engagement with constructs like "alexithymia" or "emotion regulation styles" to integrate psychological frameworks.

In the Conclusion, the statement "strengthening emotional resilience... requires coordinated efforts..." is compelling. Consider providing concrete examples of culturally adapted interventions or policy-level recommendations applicable in the Pakistani context

The Limitations section notes "researcher interpretation remains inherently subjective...". To enhance rigor, explain whether member checking or peer validation of thematic coding was implemented and how.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the Data Collection section, clarify how linguistic nuances were handled in bilingual interviews. Did transcription and coding occur in the original language, or were they translated to English prior to analysis?

Under Data Analysis, the phrase "Coding was conducted iteratively..." is vague. Specify whether coding was conducted by multiple researchers, and if so, how inter-rater reliability was addressed.

The discussion of "Media Influences" in Findings includes "Movies show tough guys." You may enhance analytical depth by identifying whether participants referenced local (e.g., Pakistani or Bollywood) or international (e.g., Hollywood) media content.

In the paragraph starting "Religious norms were mentioned...", religious affiliation is central to the argument. Consider elaborating on whether specific denominations or sects were associated with differing views on emotional expression.

The subtheme "Lack of Parental Role Models" includes the quote "Father never talks about feelings." It would be useful to explore whether any participants identified alternative role models (e.g., teachers, religious leaders) in their narratives.

In the Discussion section, the sentence "These findings support previous studies..." would be strengthened by clarifying whether the referenced studies pertain specifically to South Asian or diasporic populations, enhancing cultural contextualization.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

