

Article history: Received 20 July 2024 Revised 26 September 2024 Accepted 05 October 2024 Published online 10 January 2025

Journal of Adolescent and Youth Psychological Studies

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 2981-2526

The Effectiveness of Reality Therapy Training Based on Choice Theory on Mental Health and Emotion Regulation in Female Middle School Students

Ahdyeh. Omidi[®], Marjan. Hosseinzadeh Taghvaie^{*®}, Farahnaz. Meschi[®], Sheida. Sodagar[®], Thahereh. Ranjbari Pour[®]

¹ Department of Psychology, Karaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Karaj, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Marjantaghvai@yahoo.com

Editor	Reviewers
Abolfazl Karami	Reviewer 1: Fahime Bahonar [®]
Associate Professor, Department of	Department of counseling, Universty of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran.
Psychology, Allameh Tabataba'i University, Tehran, Iran abolfazlkarami1@gmail.com	Email: Fahime.bahonar@edu.ui.ac.ir
	Reviewer 2: Mahdi Khanjani [©]
	Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Allameh Tabataba'i University,
	Tehran, Iran.
	Email: khanjani_m@atu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The paragraph introducing Gross's emotion regulation model (p. 1) could benefit from a smoother connection to the study's focus on Reality Therapy. Highlight how these theoretical underpinnings specifically relate to Choice Theory.

While the intervention section offers a detailed breakdown, some sessions (e.g., Session 8) could benefit from examples or case illustrations to demonstrate how theoretical concepts were practically applied.

In Table 1, include confidence intervals alongside mean and standard deviation for key variables to enhance the interpretability of results.

While inferential tests are described, it would strengthen the findings to briefly mention whether assumptions for repeated measures ANOVA were met (e.g., normality, sphericity).

The significant interaction effects described in Table 3 could be accompanied by a graph to visually depict trends across groups and time points for suppression and reappraisal.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the last paragraph of the introduction, expand on the statement "a research gap is evident." Specify what previous studies lacked or failed to address regarding gender-specific interventions.

In the "Study Design and Participants" section, the inclusion and exclusion criteria are thorough, but it would be helpful to clarify how many participants were approached and how many declined, providing transparency about recruitment.

The text mentions participants were "randomly assigned," but it would be helpful to elaborate on the randomization process to strengthen the study's credibility (e.g., simple randomization, block randomization).

While the discussion effectively cites Glasser's Choice Theory, expand on how findings align or contrast with recent studies on adolescent interventions (e.g., Rakh, 2018).

Avoid overgeneralizing causal claims in statements like "Reality Therapy training based on Choice Theory significantly improved emotion regulation" (p. 7). Clarify that this is a correlational finding within a quasi-experimental design.

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

