

Article history: Received 02 May 2025 Revised 14 June 2025 Accepted 23 June 2025 Published online 01 July 2025

Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 3041-8518

Self-Defining Memories and Future Self-Continuity: A Qualitative Study in Emerging Adulthood

Paulo. Castro-Medina^{1*}, Juan Pablo. Saravia²

* Corresponding author email address: Paulocastro@gmail.com

Editor	Reviewers
Petronella Jonck®	Reviewer 1: Mohsen Kachooei ©
Associate Professor, Department of	Assistant Professor of Health Psychology, Department of Psychology, Humanities
Psychology, North-West University,	Faculty, University of Science and Culture, Tehran, Iran. kachooei.m@usc.ac.ir
Potchefstroom, South Africa	Reviewer 2: Nadereh Saadati©
petrojonck@hotmail.com	Department of Couple and Family therapy, Alliant International University,
	California, United States of America. mdaneshpour@alliant.edu

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the first paragraph, the phrase "Central to this process are self-defining memories—autobiographical episodes imbued with personal meaning..." would be clearer if it briefly contrasted self-defining memories with ordinary autobiographical memories.

When describing purposive sampling, clarify how heterogeneity in gender, socioeconomic status, and region was considered or if it emerged naturally. This will strengthen claims of representativeness.

Expand on how "theoretical saturation" was determined. For example, indicate the approximate number of interviews after which no new codes were observed.

The description "an interview guide was developed..." could be enhanced by including sample questions or mentioning whether the guide was piloted before use.

The limitations section acknowledges cultural specificity and sample size but should also address recall bias and potential interviewer influence on memory reconstruction.

¹ Senior Researcher, Centro Regional de Investigaciones Multidisciplinarias, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Cuernavaca, Mexico

² Department of Psychology, Pontifical Catholic University of Peru, Lima, Peru



Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the paragraph beginning "Yet, despite their significance, the specific ways these narrative anchors function in early adulthood remain underexplored...", explicitly emphasize the lack of Latin American studies and justify why focusing on Mexico advances the field.

In the section describing "technological shifts have introduced new external memory systems," clarify whether digital memory practices (e.g., social media archives) were an intended part of the study or emerged spontaneously in interviews.

The introduction discusses hippocampal mechanisms but does not clearly connect them to the qualitative approach. Briefly explain why citing brain structures is theoretically relevant in a narrative identity study.

The final sentence stating the study aim could be reformulated as a research question (e.g., "How do emerging adults narrate self-defining memories to maintain continuity with envisioned future selves?") to align better with qualitative traditions.

The cultural discussion is limited to individualism vs. collectivism. Consider integrating culturally specific elements like familism, intergenerational storytelling, or community orientation relevant to Mexican culture.

The discussion briefly mentions digital archives. Expand on practical implications of online memory curation for sustaining future self-continuity among young adults.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

