





Identifying Components of Positive Youth Development in Multicultural Contexts

Nadereh. Saadati¹, Necati. Çobanoğlu², Olga. Coelho^{1,3}, Seyed Amir. Saadati^{4*}




¹ Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada

² Associate Professor, Faculty of Education, Inonu University, Malatya, Turkey

³ CICPSI, Faculdade de Psicologia, Universidade de Lisboa, Alameda da Universidade, 1649-013 Lisboa, Portugal

⁴ Department of Family Medicine and Community Health, Faculty of Physical Therapy, University of Minnesota Twin Cities Medical School, Minnesota, USA

* Corresponding author email address: saada@umn.edu

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Chara A Demetriou  Department of Psychology, University of Nicosia, Nicosia, Cyprus demetriou.cha@unic.ac.cy	Reviewer 1: Abolghasem Khoshkanesh  Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran, Iran. Email: akhoshkonesh@sbu.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Masoud Asadi  Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology and Counseling, Arak University, Arak, Iran. Email: m-asadi@araku.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence “Unlike traditional approaches that primarily examine risks and vulnerabilities, PYD places emphasis on protective factors, resilience, and the cultivation of developmental assets” should be supported by a stronger theoretical framing. Consider citing more recent meta-analyses to validate the shift from deficit to strengths-based models.

The statement “By focusing on qualitative insights from diverse youth in Michigan...” would benefit from elaborating on why Michigan was chosen, given its unique cultural demographics.

The participant’s quote “At school I am American, at home I am Mexican...” is powerful, but the authors should connect it explicitly to bicultural competence literature, strengthening theoretical grounding.

The comparison with “longitudinal evidence from China” is strong, but the connection to the current study’s qualitative findings feels underdeveloped. The authors should clarify how qualitative insights complement longitudinal quantitative evidence.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The authors write, “adolescents from multicultural families often develop forms of ego-resilience...” but the text does not sufficiently distinguish ego-resilience from broader resilience constructs. Clarification of this conceptual nuance is needed.

The discussion of “gender differences in anxiety among adolescents in Spain” is important, but the paragraph could be strengthened by connecting these findings to multicultural youth in the U.S., where gender and ethnicity may intersect.

The sentence “The role of developmental assets in buffering against contemporary risks has also been highlighted...” mentions gaming disorder and gun violence. The authors should contextualize these findings within multicultural youth specifically, to avoid overgeneralization.

The narrative “My best friend is like my mirror” is strong but under-analyzed. The authors could expand on how peer mentoring supports resilience and identity in multicultural contexts.

The authors state “These findings align strongly with existing PYD scholarship while also extending understanding...”. This alignment should be demonstrated with more systematic comparison to specific cited studies, not just general agreement.

The statement “Cultural competence and diversity adaptation emerged as distinctive features” could be expanded by discussing how these themes contribute to advancing PYD theory beyond Western-centric models.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor’s decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.