

Article history: Received 07 November 2024 Revised 09 February 2025 Accepted 20 February 2025 Published online 01 April 2025

# Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling

**Open peer-review report** 



E-ISSN: 3041-8518

## Rumination and Identity Confusion as Predictors of Emotional Exhaustion in Emerging Adult Women

Farhana. Rahman<sup>1</sup>, Zainab. Al-Taie<sup>2\*</sup>

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author email address: zainab.altaie@uokufa.edu.iq

Editor	Reviewers
Chiedu Eseadi	Reviewer 1: Taher Tizdast <sup>©</sup>
Department of Educational	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad
Foundations, University of Nigeria,	University, Tonekabon, Iran. Email: taher.tizdast@toniau.ac.ir
Nsukka, Nigeria	Reviewer 2: Meysam Sadeghi <sup>©</sup>
chiedu.eseadi@unn.edu.ng	Assistant Professor of Department of Cognitive Psychology, Higher Education
	Institute of Cognitive Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: m.sadeghi@icss.ac.ir

### 1. Round 1

#### 1.1. Reviewer 1

#### Reviewer:

You may wish to define more clearly what distinguishes "passive" from "active" rumination early in the paragraph to avoid ambiguity and enhance conceptual clarity.

Since this study is cross-sectional, the term "causal link" may be misleading. Consider rephrasing to "associational link" or clarifying that the cited research used longitudinal data.

Clarify whether the IDS was translated into Arabic or Kurdish (or another local language) and whether a validation process was performed for use in this population.

The Breusch-Pagan test is mentioned, which is appropriate for assessing heteroscedasticity, but it would be beneficial to explain why this specific test was chosen over others (e.g., White test) for clarity.

The text interprets identity confusion as "somewhat lower but still present." Please define what score ranges are considered low, moderate, and high for the IDS to substantiate this interpretation.

It would benefit the reader to specify whether identity confusion leads to rumination, or vice versa—or whether your study allows for such directional inference.

This is an important point; however, supporting this gendered claim with direct data from your sample (if available) or more citations would strengthen its validity.

Department of Psychology, University of Dhaka, Dhaka, Bangladesh
Department of Health Psychology, University of Kufa, Najaf, Iraq



Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

#### 1.2. Reviewer 2

#### Reviewer:

This transition is effective, but it may benefit from a clearer statement of the research gap your study addresses (e.g., lack of data in Iraqi or Middle Eastern populations).

Although you cite the MBI-GS, consider clarifying whether any cultural or language adaptations were made to the instrument for the Iraqi context.

It would be helpful to specify whether both subscales (Brooding and Reflection) were analyzed separately or only the total RRS score was used in the regression model.

The phrase "growing body of literature" is vague. Consider specifying the most relevant recent studies or meta-analyses to ground the claim more precisely.

This explanation could be strengthened by integrating theoretical models of emotional regulation (e.g., Gross's process model) to enhance depth.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

#### 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.