

Article history: Received 13 September 2024 Revised 17 November 2024 Accepted 22 November 2024 Published online 01 October 2025

Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 3041-8518

Philosophical Dimensions of Music Therapy: Bridging the Gap Between Art and Psychology

Ali. Kian Hatami ¹, Sadeq. Rashidi ^{2*}, Ali. Moradkhani ³

^{*} Corresponding author email address: s.rashidi@cfu.ac.ir

Editor	Reviewers
Gholamreza Rajabi®	Reviewer 1: Abolghasem Khoshkanesh®
Professor of Counseling	Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran,
Department, Shahid Chamran	Iran.
University, Ahvaz, Iran	Email: akhoshkonesh@sbu.ac.ir
rajabireza@scu.ac.ir	Reviewer 2: Azade Abooei [©]
	Department of Counseling, Faculty of Humanities, University of Science and Art,
	Yazd, Iran. Email: a.abooei@tea.sau.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The first paragraph on the therapeutic potential of music therapy (lines 7–15) provides useful context but could benefit from greater specificity about the unique features of music therapy compared to other therapeutic modalities. Consider integrating examples to make this distinction clearer.

In Table 1 (lines 150–200), the subcategory "Cultural and Personal Identity" under "Music Therapy as a Therapeutic Art" is listed but lacks detailed participant quotes. Adding specific quotes could illustrate the concepts better.

The description of participant demographics (lines 120–130) is informative but lacks a clear connection to findings. For example, did age or professional background influence themes such as emotional regulation or creativity? Consider adding analysis linking demographics to results.

¹ PhD Student of Art Philosophy, Department of Philosophy, Faculty of Humanities, North Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Art Education, Faculty of Arts, Farhangian University, Tehran, Iran ³ Associate Professor, Department of Philosophy, Faculty of Humanities, North Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran



While the discussion effectively references past studies, some connections appear weak. For instance, in the paragraph discussing emotional regulation (lines 305–320), the link to Burns et al. (2015) could be elaborated to explain how spiritual support relates to emotional regulation in this study.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the discussion on music's therapeutic effects, you cite Aigen (2008) twice but only briefly refer to his contributions. Expanding on the theoretical framework proposed by Aigen would strengthen the philosophical foundation of the study (lines 20–30).

While semi-structured interviews are mentioned as the primary method (lines 75–85), no examples of key questions or topics are provided. Adding examples would improve transparency.

The methods mention NVivo for data analysis (lines 95–100), but there is no elaboration on how coding categories were developed. Was this done inductively, deductively, or both? Include more detail on the process.

The paragraph discussing spiritual insights (lines 335–345) mentions "transcendence" but does not explore how this relates to broader therapeutic goals. Consider expanding this section.

The study's participants are all from Iran, yet the discussion rarely addresses how cultural elements might shape their experiences with music therapy (lines 350–360). This omission needs addressing, especially given the cross-cultural implications mentioned in the conclusion.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

