

Article history: Received 04 September 2024 Revised 08 November 2024 Accepted 14 November 2024 Published online 01 July 2025

Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 3041-8518

Comparison of the Effectiveness of Acceptance and Commitment Therapy With and Without Compassion on the Psychological Pain Indicators of Patients With Chronic Tension Headaches

Mina. Kavian¹, Fatemeh. Shahabizadeh², Samaneh Sada. Jafar Tabatabaei³

* Corresponding author email address: f shahabizadeh@iaubir.ac.ir

Editor	Reviewers
Asoke Kumar Saha [®]	Reviewer 1: Taher Tizdast [©]
Professor Department of	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad
Psychology, Jagannath University, Dhaka, Bangladesh drasoke@psychology.jnu.ac.bd	University, Tonekabon, Iran. Email: taher.tizdast@toniau.ac.ir
	Reviewer 2: Parvaneh Mohammadkhani
	Professor, Department of Clinical Psychology, University of Rehabilitation Sciences
	and Social Health, Tehran, Iran. Email: Pa.mohammadkhani@uswr.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The paragraph beginning with "Tension headaches are among the most common types of chronic pain" contains important background information but lacks a smooth transition into the rationale for using ACT and compassion-focused therapy. Consider adding a sentence that explicitly connects the shortcomings of current treatments with the need for your research.

The discussion of the meta-analysis by Moore et al. (2019) could be expanded by specifying the study's methodology or statistical results. This would help readers better understand the significance of the findings.

In the paragraph starting with "One of the therapies that has attracted the attention of psychotherapists," you mention ACT but do not provide any examples of previous studies supporting its efficacy. Consider including a brief mention of key studies or findings.

The explanation of "self-compassion" is thorough, but the theoretical connection between ACT and compassion-focused therapy is not fully articulated. Add a sentence or two clarifying why integrating these approaches may be theoretically beneficial.

PhD Student, Department of Psychology, Bi.C., Islamic Azad University, Birjand, Iran
Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Bi.C., Islamic Azad University, Birjand, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Bi.C., Islamic Azad University, Birjand, Iran



The description of the "pretest-posttest control group design" lacks details on how randomization was performed. Please specify whether randomization was stratified or simple and how this was executed.

The sentence "Descriptive statistical methods included frequency calculation, percentage, mean, standard deviation, Levene's test, Kolmogorov-Smirnov test, regression slope test, and multivariate covariance analysis with repeated measures using SPSS 22" lists statistical tests without explaining why they were appropriate. Consider providing justification for the use of each method.

The findings presented in Table 1 could be better contextualized. Add a sentence that summarizes the key descriptive statistics for the reader before delving into the MANCOVA results.

In the ANCOVA results, specify which assumptions of the analysis were tested (e.g., homogeneity of variance) and whether these assumptions were met, as this would strengthen the validity of your findings.

The interpretation of the MANCOVA results ("there is a significant difference between the ACT with Compassion group, the ACT without Compassion group, and the control group") should include effect sizes to provide a more comprehensive understanding of the practical significance.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The sentence "Despite the persistent efforts of physicians to reduce the prevalence of this condition, none of the medical treatments alone have been able to significantly reduce pain or improve emotional and physical functioning" could benefit from a brief mention of specific limitations of these medical treatments to strengthen the argument.

The sentence "The groups were matched based on gender, age, and education level" could benefit from clarification. Specify how these variables were balanced or if any statistical tests were used to confirm matching.

Your exclusion criteria are comprehensive, but consider elaborating on why certain factors, like "unusual life stressors," were excluded. This would provide a clearer understanding of potential confounders.

The explanation regarding sample size calculation ("alpha = 0.05, effect size = 0.25, power = 0.80") could be more robust if you included the software or method used to perform this calculation.

The ACT intervention description provides session details but does not indicate the duration of each session. Please specify how long each session lasted to give readers a clearer understanding of the intervention's intensity.

In the compassion-focused ACT section, clarify the role of metaphors in therapy. How do these metaphors function to facilitate acceptance or compassion, and why were they chosen?

The paragraph starting with "Another factor contributing to the effectiveness of compassion-based therapy is assertive behavior and mindfulness" could benefit from references to specific studies that support these claims.

The comparison between ACT with and without compassion is insightful, but it might be improved by discussing any potential limitations in the study design that could have influenced these results, such as the convenience sampling method.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

