

Comparison of the Effectiveness of Stress-Based Mindfulness Training and Acceptance and Commitment Therapy on Social Anxiety and Perfectionism in Female Students




Mahin. Baharvand¹, Shoja. Araban^{2*}, Davoud. Kordestani³

¹ PhD Student in General Psychology, Department of Psychology, Borujerd Branch, Islamic Azad University, Borujerd, Iran

² Assistant Professor Department of Educational Sciences, Farhangian University, Lorestan, Iran

³ Associate Professor Department of Psychology, Payam Noor University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: sh.araban@cfu.ac.ir

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Azizuddin Khan  Professor, Psychophysiology Laboratory, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences Indian Institute of Technology Bombay, Maharashtra, India aziz@hss.iitb.ac.in	Reviewer 1: Roodabeh Hooshmandi  Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: roodhooshmandi@kmanresce.ca Reviewer 2: Thseen Nazir  Professor of Psychology and Counseling Department, Ibn Haldun University, Istanbul, Turkey. Email: thseen.nazir@ihu.edu.tr

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the first paragraph, the authors mention, "Social anxiety is one of the most prevalent anxiety disorders..." Consider including more recent data or statistics on the global prevalence of social anxiety to provide a clearer understanding of its impact.

The use of convenience sampling is mentioned briefly. It would be helpful to elaborate on why this method was preferred and discuss potential biases it might introduce.

The description of the stress-based mindfulness training and ACT sessions is detailed but could be improved by specifying the rationale behind the sequence of activities for each session.

The sentence, "The Social Phobia Inventory (SPI) has high reliability and validity," should be supported with more detail, such as specific studies or additional statistics to bolster credibility.

The rationale for choosing the Positive and Negative Perfectionism Questionnaire could be expanded to explain why it was appropriate for this specific population of students.

The authors mention using pre-tests and post-tests, but clarifying how these were administered (e.g., in a group setting or individually) could provide a more complete methodological picture.

In Table 2, the covariance analysis results are presented. A brief explanation of why ANCOVA was chosen over other statistical methods would enhance the readers' understanding.

The findings related to the effectiveness of mindfulness and ACT interventions are compelling. It would be beneficial to include a brief discussion on any unintended effects or variations in individual responses.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the literature review, the discussion about Clark and Wells' (2001) model could be expanded to include contrasting views or the latest critiques to provide a balanced perspective.

The explanation of the cognitive models (paragraph three) is thorough, but adding a brief comparison with biological or developmental models could strengthen the theoretical context.

The sentence, "The sample consisted of 45 female high school students from District 4 of Tehran," could benefit from additional detail on why this specific demographic was chosen and how it impacts the study's generalizability.

The statement, "The distribution of the variables in this study is normal," could be improved by discussing how the normality assumption was tested, particularly with respect to outliers or non-normal distributions.

The explanation, "The F-value for the effect of the independent variables... is significant," should include a brief discussion of the practical implications of these findings.

The sentence, "From the total sample of 45 female high school students..." is helpful but could be supplemented by a discussion on the impact of age variations within the sample on the study outcomes.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.