



Identification of Indicators for Personalized Marketing with an Artificial Intelligence Approach in the Fourth Industrial Revolution


Seyed Yasser. Mousavian¹, Mahmoud. Ahmadisharif^{1*}, Farzad. Asayesh¹, Dariyoush. Jamshidi²

¹ Department of Business Management, Shahr-e-Qods Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran.


² Department of Business Management, Shiraz branch, Islamic Azad University, Shiraz, Iran. n

* Corresponding author email address: sharif58@gmail.com

Editor

Arpana Rai
Assistant Professor, Indian Institute
of Management, Udaipur, Mumbai,
India
arpana.raii@iimu.ac.in

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Rezvan Hosseingholizadeh
Associate Professor, Department of Educational Management and Human Resource
Development, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran. Email:
rhgholizadeh@um.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Ali Sargolzaie
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Zahedan Branch, Islamic Azad
University, Zahedan, Iran.
Email: a.sargolzaie@iauzah.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "Despite the advances in AI technologies, there remains a gap in understanding how these innovations can be effectively integrated..." would benefit from citing more recent empirical works that directly support the claim of limited integration frameworks in marketing practice.

The sentence "Participants are selected through purposive sampling..." would benefit from stating inclusion and exclusion criteria explicitly, to clarify how eligibility was determined beyond domain expertise.

The term "theoretical saturation" is mentioned, but the article does not describe how saturation was assessed or confirmed. Consider referencing Guest et al. (2006) or similar qualitative saturation criteria.

Although the interview format is described, the actual interview guide or thematic anchors are not included or appended. Including them as supplementary material or summarizing them in-text would enhance methodological transparency.

Several themes such as “personalized experiences on websites and apps” are repeated under multiple categories. Consider collapsing or clarifying overlapping themes to enhance parsimony and interpretability.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The paragraph beginning with “The implications of AI-driven personalized marketing...” includes diverse themes (e.g., consumer behavior, anticipation of needs). Consider breaking it into two focused paragraphs: one on anticipatory AI capabilities, and one on influence on decision-making.

The article does not describe trustworthiness measures such as member checking, peer debriefing, or triangulation. Please elaborate on any procedures used to ensure qualitative rigor and credibility of findings.

While demographic data is described textually, consider presenting it as a separate demographic table (e.g., Table 2), including participants' roles, gender, age ranges, and experience level for clarity.

The statement "These initial codes are then grouped into themes and sub-themes..." would benefit from a brief example of coding from raw data to basic themes, to illustrate the process.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor’s decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.