

Determining the Dimensions and Components of Professional Citizenship Education at Islamic Azad University, Tehran Province

Maryam. Molapour¹, Hosseinali. Jahed^{2*}, Leila. Saedi³, Reza. Sorani Yancheshme⁴

¹ PhD Student, Department of Educational Management, West Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Educational Management, West Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Public Administration, West Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

⁴ Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Management, West Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: jahediau@gmail.com

Editor

Marion Fortin^{id}
Full Professor, TSM-Research,
CNRS, University Toulouse
Capitole, France
marion.fortin@tsm-education.fr

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Manijeh Haghghinasab^{id}
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Alzahra University, Tehran, Iran
Email: haghghinasab@srbiau.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Marco Yamba-Yugsi^{id}
Unidad Académica de Posgrado, Universidad Católica de Cuenca, Azuay 010101,
Ecuador
Email: marco.yamba@ucacue.edu.ec

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The objective of the study could be more specific. For example, instead of "to identify dimensions and components," specify what outcomes or applications are envisioned for professional citizenship education.

The table is informative but dense. Consider simplifying or using visual aids (e.g., bolded categories, color coding) to improve readability.

While diverse methods are proposed, their practical feasibility (e.g., resource demands) is not discussed. Adding this would make the recommendations more actionable.

High-speed internet is emphasized, but specific digital tools or platforms that align with professional citizenship education goals are not mentioned. Clarify this aspect.

Cultural resistance to digital tools is mentioned but not contextualized with examples. Including specific cases or data could strengthen this argument.

The study overlooks the voices of students. Highlighting this limitation and suggesting methods to include their perspectives in future research would strengthen the argument.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The term "professional citizenship education" appears frequently but is not explicitly defined in the introduction. Providing a definition would aid comprehension.

The claim about the importance of global citizenship education could be strengthened by citing more recent or diverse international studies.

The description of the thematic analysis process is vague. Include more details on how themes were identified and validated.

While the six main themes are mentioned, their interrelationships or hierarchical importance is not discussed. Adding this perspective could enhance understanding.

The section mentions "digital educational games," but their potential impact or examples from existing literature are missing. Providing this would add credibility.

The paper relies on qualitative data. Mentioning potential quantitative validation of findings in future research could address generalizability concerns.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.