



Providing a Digital Transformation Model for Public Sector Organizations (Case Study: Iraq)

Ali. Amer Naser¹, Saeid. Aghasi^{2*}, Sayyed Mohammad Reza. Davoodi³, Ahmed Abdullah. Amanah⁴

¹ PhD Student, Department of Public Administration, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Social and Cultural Researches Center, Dehaghan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Dehaghan, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Business Administration, Faculty of Management and Economics, Karbala University, Karbala, Iraq


⁴ Associate Professor of Social and Cultural Researches Center, Dehaghan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Dehaghan, Iran


* Corresponding author email address: Sae_ghasi@yahoo.com

Editor

Rezvan Hosseingholizadeh
Associate Professor, Department of Educational Management and Human Resource Development, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran
rhgholizadeh@um.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Ali Sargolzaie
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Zahedan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Zahedan, Iran.
Email: a.sargolzaie@iauzah.ac.ir

Reviewer 2: Alinaghi Amiri
Professor, Management Department, Tehran University, Tehran, Iran.
Email: anamiri@ut.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence, "Digital transformation enables companies to achieve greater flexibility and efficiency..." lacks specificity regarding the public sector organizations mentioned in the title. Consider explicitly linking these benefits to public sector challenges.

The article references prior studies on multinational corporations and digital transformation but lacks citations directly related to the public sector's unique challenges in digitalization. Adding specific studies related to public sector digital transformation in similar contexts (e.g., Iraq or developing countries) would enhance the introduction.

Table 1 presents important effect sizes, but some categories, such as "Creating specialized agile teams," lack sufficient explanation in the text. Ensure each key finding is fully explained in the results narrative.

The homogeneity test results are mentioned in passing, yet they are critical for justifying the random-effects model used. Expand on why heterogeneity is present among the studies and its implications for the findings.

While the results section is data-heavy, the discussion does not critically engage with the possible limitations of your findings, such as the generalizability of results from a meta-analysis largely based on non-Iraqi studies.

The conclusion introduces some new information about the importance of "career advancement opportunities and recognizing digital successes," which was not explicitly addressed in the findings. Ensure the conclusion fully reflects the study's results.

Terms like "digital transformation" and "digitalization" seem to be used interchangeably. Clarify the distinction between these terms or define them explicitly to maintain consistency.

Authors revised the manuscripts.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The research question posed in the introduction is clear but overly broad. Consider refining the question to focus on the specific aspects of digital transformation (e.g., leadership, agility, or strategy) that this study addresses.

In the "Methods and Materials" section, you state that the total sample population includes 120 research articles, 9 theses, and 6 books, but it is unclear how these sources were selected or weighted. A clearer explanation of the selection criteria or sampling strategy for the meta-analysis is needed.

The use of "meta-analysis" is mentioned, but there is insufficient detail on how effect sizes were calculated, especially for qualitative data like theses and books. Clarify how the quantitative and qualitative data were integrated in the meta-analysis.

The discussion lacks a comparison between your findings and those of other studies on digital transformation models. Consider adding a section that situates your model within the context of existing models from other regions or sectors.

The sentence "organizations should define their digital strategies and set managerial objectives..." is too general. Provide more concrete recommendations or examples based on your findings.

Some references appear outdated or unrelated to digital transformation in public sector organizations, such as Ghorbani et al. (2013). Ensure that the most relevant and recent studies are included.

The role of leadership is mentioned as significant in digital transformation, yet this section lacks depth. Provide more discussion on leadership's specific role, particularly in the public sector context, which might differ from private sector leadership.

Authors revised the manuscripts.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.