






# Macro Framework Design for Policies on Developing and Expanding Employment Opportunities for Higher Education Graduates in the Country

Malek. Shokri<sup>1</sup> , Jafar. Beikzad<sup>2\*</sup> , Alireza. Islambolchi<sup>3\*</sup> , Rostam. Gharehdaghi<sup>4</sup> , Kambiz. Hamidi<sup>5</sup> 

<sup>1</sup> PhD Student, Department of Management, Hamedan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Hamedan, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Associate Professor of Public Administration Department, Bonab Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bonab, Iran


<sup>3</sup> Associate Professor, Department of Management, Hamedan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Hamedan, Iran

<sup>4</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Public Administration, Miyaneh Branch, Islamic Azad University, Miyaneh, Iran



<sup>5</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Hamedan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Hamedan, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: beikzad\_jafar@yahoo.com

## Editor

Florence DiGennaro Reed   
Professor in the Department of  
Applied Behavioral Science,  
University of Kansas, US  
fdreed@ku.edu

## Reviewers

**Reviewer 1:** Masoud Hoseinchari   
Associate Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Shiraz University, Shiraz,  
Iran. Email: hchhari@shirazu.ac.ir  
**Reviewer 2:** Alinaghi Amiri   
Professor, Management Department, Tehran University, Tehran, Iran.  
Email: anamiri@ut.ac.ir

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the introduction, provide more detailed background information about the unemployment rates and challenges faced by higher education graduates in the country. This will set a stronger context for the need for the proposed macro framework.

In the section where the data analysis is described, provide more details on the coding process. For example, expand on the sentence "Data were processed and reviewed in multiple stages" by detailing each stage of the thematic analysis.

Discuss how validity and reliability were ensured in the study. The sentence "After ensuring acceptable validity and reliability for the qualitative model" should be supported by specific techniques or methods used to achieve this.

The findings section should be more structured and clearly differentiate between the three macro frameworks. Use subheadings to separate "Policies to strengthen the demand side," "Policies to strengthen the supply side," and "Dual employment creation policies."

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

### 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The literature review section should include a more comprehensive discussion of existing frameworks and models related to employment policies for higher education graduates. For example, the discussion around "institutional approach" could benefit from additional references and comparison with alternative models.

The methodology section should provide more details about the semi-structured interview process, such as the specific questions asked and how the interviews were conducted and recorded. The sentence "Data were collected through semi-structured interviews with a group of experts" should be expanded to include this information.

Explain the rationale for selecting the 14 experts and how their expertise is relevant to the study. Clarify the sentence "The expert group members were selected using purposeful sampling from three categories" by describing the criteria used for selection.

Discuss the theoretical implications of the proposed framework in more detail. For instance, the sentence "The model includes 3 comprehensive macro frameworks" could be followed by a discussion on how these frameworks contribute to existing theories in employment policy.

Expand the practical recommendations section to provide more actionable steps for policymakers. For example, the suggestion "Approving targeted laws and regulations" should include specific types of laws and potential impacts.

In the discussion section, compare your findings with those of similar studies more explicitly. The sentence "This matter has been examined in previous studies" should be followed by specific examples and how your findings align or differ.

The conclusion should succinctly summarize the key findings and their implications for policy and practice. The sentence "Based on the findings and results, research proposals are presented" should be expanded to highlight the most critical proposals.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.