

Investigating the Components of Transformational Leadership: A Qualitative Study on the National Iranian Oil Terminals Company (NIOTC)

Samira. Biramvand¹, Hamdollah. Manzari Tavakoli^{2*}, Mohammad Jalal. Kamali³, Zahra. Shokouh³, Navid. Fatehi Rad³


¹ PhD Student, Department of Public Administration, Kerman Branch, Islamic Azad University, Kerman, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Management, Kerman Branch, Islamic Azad University, Kerman, Iran



³ Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Kerman Branch, Islamic Azad University, Kerman, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: h_manzari33@yahoo.com

Editor

Mehdi Rostami¹
Department of Psychology and
Counseling, KMAN Research
Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario,
Canada
mehdirostami@kmanresce.ca

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Ali Choori¹
Assistant Professor of Sports Management, Faculty of Humanities and Sports
Sciences, Gonbadkavos University, Gonbadkavos, Iran. Email: choori@gonbad.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Asghar Jafari¹
Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Kashan University, Iran. Email:
as_jafari@sbu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The introduction could benefit from a more detailed explanation of the theoretical framework guiding this study. While transformational leadership theory is mentioned, a more comprehensive discussion of its key components and how they relate to the current study would provide clearer context for the reader.

In the methods section, clarify the rationale behind the sample size of 19 participants. Although theoretical saturation is mentioned, it would be useful to explain how it was determined that saturation was reached and why 19 participants were sufficient to achieve comprehensive insights.

Some themes identified in the findings could be more clearly defined. For instance, "Supporting Organizational Learning" and "Transforming Cultural Values" are broad themes that might benefit from more specific sub-themes or examples from the data.

The findings include direct quotes, which add depth to the analysis. However, ensure that these quotes are representative of the broader dataset. It would be useful to indicate the frequency of similar responses to demonstrate the prevalence of these themes.

In the discussion section, provide a more detailed comparison between your findings and existing literature. For example, when discussing "setting elevated goals," compare your findings with those of Bajracharya (2023) and explain any similarities or differences in more depth.

The conclusion would benefit from a more concise summary of the key findings. Highlight the most important components of transformational leadership identified in the study and their implications for organizational practice.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The introduction references numerous studies, but it lacks a critical evaluation of these studies' findings. For example, the statement "Research has demonstrated the profound effects of transformational leadership on various organizational metrics" could be strengthened by discussing the strengths and weaknesses of the cited studies (Avolio et al., 1999; Bajracharya, 2023).

Include more detail about the semi-structured interview guide. What were some of the key questions asked? How were they designed to elicit responses that would address the research objectives?

The data analysis section mentions the use of NVivo software but lacks detail on the coding process. Describe the steps taken to code the data and how themes were identified and validated.

The practical implications of the study could be expanded. Provide more specific recommendations for managers in the oil and gas sector on how they can implement transformational leadership practices based on your findings.

The limitations section mentions potential biases due to self-reported data. Consider discussing additional limitations, such as the potential impact of the specific cultural and organizational context of NIOTC on the generalizability of your findings.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.