





Design and Development of a Maturity Model for Performance Evaluation of Managers with a Modern Technology Approach in Bank Melli Iran (Fuzzy Delphi Method)

Ehsan, Kyiani Ghalenoo¹, Habibollah. Salarzahi^{2*}, Bahareh. Naseri³, Abdolali. Keshtegar²


¹ PhD student in Human Resource Management, Department of Management, Zahedan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Zahedan, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Public Administration, Faculty of Economics, Management and Accounting, University of Sistan and Baluchestan, Zahedan, Iran



³ Assistant Professor, Department of Public Administration, Faculty of Humanities, Zahedan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Zahedan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: salarzahi@mgmt.usb.ac.ir

Editor

Khaliquzzaman Khan¹
Associate Professor, School of
Business Administration, Al Dar
University College, United Arab
Emirates
kaliquzzaman.khan@aue.ae

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Abbas Monavarian¹
Professor, Management Department, Tehran University, Tehran, Iran.
Email: amonavar@ut.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Rezvan Hosseingholizadeh¹
Associate Professor, Department of Educational Management and Human Resource
Development, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran. Email:
rhgholizadeh@um.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the introduction, you state, "The growth of knowledge and information technology security in developing countries is increasing." It would be helpful to provide specific examples or data to support this claim to strengthen the context.

The non-probabilistic sampling method is mentioned. Clarify why this method was chosen over probabilistic sampling and discuss any potential biases it might introduce and how you mitigated them.

Provide more details on the criteria for selecting the 15 academic and professional banking industry experts. Specifically, explain how their expertise aligns with the research needs to justify their selection comprehensively.

The description of the data collection process through semi-structured interviews and questionnaires should be expanded. Include information on the type of questions asked and how they were designed to elicit relevant information.

In the findings section, you mention the use of SPSS and PLS software for factor analysis and path analysis. Provide more detail on the specific statistical techniques and criteria used for analysis, such as the thresholds for significance.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The introduction references multiple studies (e.g., Scott et al., 2017; Chai et al., 2016). Consider expanding the literature review to provide more depth on how these studies specifically relate to your research and highlight any gaps your study addresses.

On the methodology section, "Since the Delphi method is conducted with the participation of individuals who have specialized information on the research topic," it would be beneficial to explain why the Delphi method is particularly suitable for this study compared to other methods.

In Table 1, you list the factors and components but do not explain how each was derived from the data. Include a brief description of the factor analysis process and the rationale for including each factor and component.

You state, "In this research, a threshold value of 0.7 was considered." Explain why this threshold was chosen and how it aligns with standards in the field.

The discussion of excluded indicators is important. Provide a rationale for excluding specific indicators, such as non-existent knowledge and customer proximity, and discuss how their exclusion might impact the overall model.

The interpretation of the fuzzy mean and definite mean differences could be expanded. Explain what a mean difference of less than 0.1 signifies in practical terms for the maturity model's validity.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.