





# Presentation of an Organizational Citizenship Model Based on Discourse Theory (Education Management in Basra Province)

Mohammad Hamzeh Mansoor. Altalebi<sup>1</sup>, Mehrdad. Sadeghi<sup>2\*</sup>, Riyaz Hossein Abais. Al-Murshidi<sup>3</sup>, Saeed. Sharifi<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> PhD student in Human Resource Management, Faculty of Islamic Governance, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Department of Cultural Management, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

<sup>3</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Karbala University, Karbala, Iraq



<sup>4</sup> Associate Professor, Faculty of Islamic Governance, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: mehr.sadeghi@khuif.ac.ir

### Editor

Marion Fortin<sup>1</sup>  
Full Professor, TSM-Research,  
CNRS, University Toulouse  
Capitole, France  
marion.fortin@tsm-education.fr

### Reviewers

**Reviewer 1:** Marco Yamba-Yugsi<sup>1</sup>  
Unidad Académica de Posgrado, Universidad Católica de Cuenca, Azuay 010101,  
Ecuador  
Email: marco.yamba@ucacue.edu.ec  
**Reviewer 2:** Ali Sargolzaie<sup>1</sup>  
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Zahedan Branch, Islamic Azad  
University, Zahedan, Iran.  
Email: a.sargolzaie@iauzah.ac.ir

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The model's description in the Methodology section could benefit from more details regarding the underlying assumptions and justifications for the choice of structural equation modeling. Additionally, include a rationale for the use of partial least squares over other modeling techniques.

Please elaborate on why random availability sampling was considered suitable for this study, particularly in the context of potential biases this method might introduce. An explanation on how this method impacts the generalizability of the findings would strengthen this section.

The manuscript briefly mentions the use of the Delphi technique but lacks depth in describing how each round was conducted and how consensus was reached. Detailing these processes would enhance the transparency and reproducibility of the research.

While the manuscript mentions the use of SMART-PLS software, it lacks detailed reporting on the model fit indices (e.g., RMSEA, CFI, TLI). Adding these would help in evaluating the adequacy of the model fit.

The Results section should include a discussion on the variance explained by the model for each construct. This would provide clarity on how much of the variability in outcomes can be attributed to the model versus other unexplained factors.

The review could be improved by including a comparison with similar models in the literature. Highlighting how this model differs from or improves upon previous models in talent management could provide stronger justification for its relevance and novelty.

The conclusion offers recommendations for practice, but these could be better supported by linking them directly to specific findings from the study. This connection would make the practical implications more robust and directly actionable.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

### 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The theoretical underpinning of the study should be strengthened. Discussing core theories that guide the structural equation model could help in anchoring the study's findings within established research.

More information on the construct validity of the measurement instruments used (questionnaire) is needed. Discuss the processes used for testing and ensuring the validity and reliability of the constructs beyond Cronbach's alpha.

Clarify the process of data collection, especially the measures taken to minimize response bias and ensure the accuracy of responses in the qualitative component of the study.

The influence of demographic variables (age, gender, education) on the model outcomes is not addressed. Analyzing these effects could provide deeper insights into the model's applicability across different groups.

Expand on the ethical considerations section by detailing the procedures for obtaining informed consent and ensuring the confidentiality of participants' responses, which is especially critical in organizational studies.

Some of the interpretations made from the statistical findings seem overstated. Provide a more cautious interpretation of the results, considering the limitations and potential confounders in the study design.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.