

Article history: Received 22 November 2024 Revised 03 February 2025 Accepted 11 February 2025 Published online 01 September 2025

Applied Family Therapy Journal

OPEN PEER-REVIEW REPORT



E-ISSN: 3041-8798

Identifying Patterns of Inconsistency in Parenting Practices and Their Interpretations by Adolescents: A Narrative Inquiry

Mariana. Oliveira 10, Carmen. Sánchez 2*0

^{*} Corresponding author email address: carmen.sanchez@ucm.es

Editor	Reviewers
Habib Hadianfard Affiliation: Professor, Department of Psychology, Shiraz University, Iran hadianfd@shirazu.ac.ir	Reviewer 1: Seyed Ali Darbani Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology and Counseling, South Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran. Email: Ali.darbani@iau.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Abolghasem Khoshkanesh Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran, Iran. Email: akhoshkonesh@sbu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "Narrative inquiry into how young people perceive and construct meaning from such inconsistencies is thus vital" would benefit from a stronger justification on why narrative inquiry is preferable over other qualitative designs such as grounded theory or phenomenology.

The statement "Although quantitative studies have provided valuable insights..." is appropriate, but you should clearly articulate the specific gap that narrative inquiry fills, and how adolescents' meaning-making processes differ from statistical correlations.

The demographic description refers to "21 participants from South Africa aged 28 to 54 years," which contradicts both your Methods section and the stated adolescent focus. This must be corrected as it undermines the credibility of results.

The quotation "My mom tells me to be independent, but when I make decisions, she says I should have asked first" illustrates mixed parental messages. Please contextualize whether this theme was common across gender or specific subgroups.

While you note reliance on self-reports, you should also discuss how researcher positionality (e.g., cultural distance between interviewers and adolescents) might have influenced interpretation, given that reflexive journaling is only briefly mentioned.

¹ Department of Clinical Psychology, University of São Paulo, São Paulo, Brazil

² Department of Psychology, Complutense University of Madrid, Madrid, Spain



Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In citing Walters (2023), the phrase "mediated by personality traits such as low conscientiousness and agreeableness" is presented, but you do not explain how these personality traits intersect with the concept of inconsistent parenting. Please expand.

The sentence "Kapetanovic and Boson (2020) showed that discrepancies between parental and adolescent reports of communication were strongly related to adolescents' psychological health" could be better integrated by explaining how discrepancies in perception contribute to lived experiences of inconsistency.

The sentence "These accounts align with findings by Kapetanovic and Boson (2020)" could be enriched by clarifying whether adolescents' interpretations of inconsistency mirror the measured discrepancies in prior quantitative research.

When discussing "conflict spillover," you state "This finding resonates with Voort et al. (2013)". However, you do not explain how maternal sensitivity (from Voort) conceptually connects to your observed narratives of "conditional affection." Please elaborate.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

