

Article history: Received 04 December 2024 Revised 11 February 2025 Accepted 21 February 2025 Published online 01 April 2025

Applied Family Therapy Journal

OPEN PEER-REVIEW REPORT



E-ISSN: 3041-8798

Cultural Silence and Emotional Suppression in Asian-American Families: A Phenomenological Exploration

Sophia. Lee¹, Brian. Matthews^{2*}, Jennifer. Torres³

^{*} Corresponding author email address: bmatthews@umich.edu

Editor	Reviewers
Shahram Vahedi	Reviewer 1: Faranak Saboonchi
Professor, Department of	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Payam Noor University, Tehran,
Educational Psychology, Faculty of	Iran. Email: faranaksaboonchi@pnu.ac.ir
Educational Sciences and	Reviewer 2: Maasuomeh Behboodi
Psychology, Tabriz University,	Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad
Tabriz, Iran	University, Roudehen, Iran. Email: masomehbehbodi@riau.ac.ir
vahedi117@yahoo.com	

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The phrase "emotional regulation is not simply an individual endeavor but a relational act" is compelling but underexplored. Please expand on this theoretical framing using cross-cultural emotion regulation theories such as those proposed by Matsumoto or Mesquita.

The methodological rationale for using a phenomenological approach is well-stated. However, it would be improved by referencing key methodological sources (e.g., van Manen, Moustakas) to enhance academic rigor.

Consider including sample questions from the interview guide in an appendix or summarizing 2–3 here to provide the reader with a sense of how emotional suppression was elicited.

The phrase "codes and themes were continuously compared across interviews" could be strengthened by specifying whether methods like constant comparison or framework analysis were employed. Including a citation for Braun & Clarke or other thematic analysis authorities would also be advisable.

¹ Department of Psychology and Counseling, Stanford University, Stanford, USA

Department of Health Psychology, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, USA
Department of Educational Psychology, University of California, Berkeley, USA



The sentence "Rather than discussing feelings openly, many learned to communicate through subtle means" could be enhanced by linking to theoretical work on high-context versus low-context communication cultures.

The phrase "difficulty naming and processing emotions" aligns with the concept of alexithymia. Consider briefly noting this construct and its relevance in cross-cultural psychology.

While the section is rich, it would benefit from distinguishing between coping strategies initiated individually (e.g., journaling) and those involving external support (e.g., therapy), perhaps drawing on coping typologies (e.g., emotion-focused vs. problem-focused coping).

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The statement "silence becomes both a shield and a script" is evocative. However, it would strengthen the argument to briefly reference relevant theoretical models such as emotion socialization theory or intergenerational transmission models.

When stating that "mental illness is viewed as a source of shame," consider including empirical support, perhaps referencing prevalence data on mental health stigma among Asian-American subgroups to ground this generalization.

When stating "Emotional stoicism was often praised or expected," consider discussing whether this is linked to Confucian ethics or broader East Asian philosophical traditions, and include appropriate sources to enhance cultural specificity.

The phrase "Suppression was not only associated with personal distress..." would benefit from a more precise articulation of which specific mental health outcomes were observed in this study and how they align with cited literature.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

