

The Role of Modern Marital Therapies: A Comparative Analysis of the Effectiveness of the Gottman Approach and Cognitive-Behavioral Therapy on Marital Satisfaction (A Case Study of Married Students at Islamic Azad University, Hamedan Branch)

Abdolreza. Saravi^{1*}, Ahmad Ali. jadidyan², Arezo. Nejatian Tanha³

¹ MA, Department of Educational Sciences and Psychology, Hamedan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Hamedan, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Kangavar Branch, Islamic Azad University, Kangavar, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Sciences and Psychology, Hamedan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Hamedan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: saravi1665@yahoo.com

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Manijeh Daneshpour ^{ORCID} Department of Couple and Family therapy, Alliant International University, California, United States of America mdaneshpour@alliant.edu	Reviewer 1: Ali Akbar Soleymanian ^{ORCID} Associate Professor of Counseling Department, Bojnord University, Iran. Email: Soleymanian@ub.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Masoud Asadi ^{ORCID} Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology and Counseling, Arak University, Arak, Iran. Email: m-asadi@araku.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The statement “Marital satisfaction describes an individual's overall sense of contentment...” is broad. Please consider clarifying how marital satisfaction differs from related constructs such as marital adjustment or dyadic functioning, and cite theoretical models to strengthen this conceptual framing.

The sentence “When applying the cognitive-behavioral model, educating couples about this approach is crucial.” is valuable, but consider referencing literature supporting the role of psychoeducation in therapeutic adherence or efficacy.

The description of the ten sessions is clear, but some overlap exists with standard psychoeducational programs. Please clarify whether fidelity checks or adherence ratings were used to ensure implementation accuracy.

You mention that scores improved post-intervention but do not report confidence intervals or effect size statistics for each dimension. Consider including partial η^2 or Cohen's d values per subscale for transparency.

The statement “The effect size indicates that Gottman couple therapy was more effective...” needs further qualification. The difference between $\eta^2 = .789$ and $\eta^2 = .721$, while numerically distinct, may not be practically significant. Please interpret this in terms of practical relevance.

The non-significant ANOVA result ($p = .078$) suggests that group differences were marginal. Consider discussing whether the study was sufficiently powered to detect small effect sizes, and include a post-hoc power analysis if possible.

You mention Gottman’s “Four Horsemen” and “Emotional Bank Account,” but these concepts are not explained earlier. Please introduce these theoretical components in the Introduction or Methods for coherence.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

You state “The decline in marital satisfaction has become one of the most prevalent issues in contemporary society.” This assertion needs empirical support. Please cite recent statistics or epidemiological studies to substantiate this claim.

The research question is posed well, but the rationale for choosing a student population is insufficient. Please elaborate on why married students are a particularly relevant or vulnerable group for this intervention.

The sentence “The final session focused on assertiveness training...” is vague. Please indicate whether standardized CBT manuals were followed, and if adaptations were made for cultural appropriateness.

The statement “These findings are consistent with numerous studies in this field...” would be strengthened by specifying which mechanisms or components of the therapies were most influential, as supported by those studies.

The phrase “fostering a positive relationship culture” is valuable but vague. Please explain what constitutes such a culture in measurable terms (e.g., specific behaviors, emotional climates).

The phrase “Both methods emphasize... the creation of a positive emotional environment.” would benefit from supporting references and a clearer delineation of how each therapy achieves this outcome.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor’s decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.